WHEN THE BILL COMES DUE: EVOLUTION OF STUDENT LOAN REPAYMENT

DOCUMENTARY FILM SERIES
Looking Back to Move Forward: A History of Federal Student Aid

VIEWING GUIDE
In *A History of Federal Student Aid*, a documentary series produced by Lumina Foundation and the Institute for Higher Education Policy, key policy makers, their staff, and education researchers provide insight into the evolution of federal student aid through their first-hand experiences with the policymaking process. This short film on the history of federal student loan repayment plans administered by the U.S. Department of Education is one in a series of several that illuminates past seminal moments and offers instructive lessons and building blocks to guide newer policy innovations.
The first federal student loan program was designed to increase the number of students pursuing careers in areas considered important to national security. As student loan programs expanded to serve a broader cross-section of students and became the federal government’s primary form of student aid, repayment options—including plans based on income—evolved to help students manage loan debt and you end up defaulting.

—Mark Zuckerman

### Film Synopsis

The first federal student loan program was designed to increase the number of students pursuing careers in areas considered important to national security. As student loan programs expanded to serve a broader cross-section of students and became the federal government’s primary form of student aid, repayment options—including plans based on income—evolved to help students manage loan debt.

*When the Bill Comes Due: Evolution of Student Loan Repayment*, a 12-minute documentary, explores these early repayment options and follows the evolution of income-driven repayment plans.

### Historical Information

#### 1950s–1990s: Shifting From Standard to Income-Driven Repayment

*Scene: 1:25-4:34 minutes*

The federal government designed the first student loan repayment plan as part of the National Defense Student Loan (NDSL) Program—later renamed the Perkins Loan Program—in 1958. The goal was to regain the United States’ position as a global leader for the development of knowledge and technology over the Soviet Union by attracting more Americans into related fields.

The U.S. Treasury distributed NDSL funds to colleges and universities, and the institutions distributed the money to eligible students in science, mathematics, engineering, foreign language, or teaching disciplines. Students could borrow up to $1,000 annually but no more than $5,000 over the course of their studies. Starting one year after college graduation, borrowers were required to repay the loan annually, in equal installments, for up to 11 years. However, at the discretion of the U.S. Department of Health, Education, and Welfare, precursor to the current U.S. Department of Education, borrowers could choose a graduated repayment schedule—meaning they could start with low annual payments and gradually increase the amount.

Tom Butts

The National Defense Student Loan Program… included a provision that enabled students to have their loans cancelled… That program in the large context is the framework for almost all of the student loan repayment and forgiveness programs that we have today.
The next federal loan program, the Guaranteed Student Loan (GSL) Program and its accompanying repayment plan, was created through the Higher Education Act (HEA) of 1965. To provide student loans, the federal government used money from banks and guaranteed that if students defaulted on their loans, the government would pay off the amount owed.7 GSL’s repayment term, known as the Standard Repayment Plan, had an initial grace period of nine to 12 months, followed by payments made in fixed installments over a 10-year term.8,9

Federal repayment plans were not major topics of debate until the 1980s, when student loan default rates began steadily increasing (see figure 1). As part of the 1986 HEA Reauthorization, the Reagan Administration proposed revising the NDSL Program to include an income-driven repayment plan.10 The proposal would have required borrowers to follow a repayment schedule based on their income after graduation and loan amount, allowed for the period of repayment to extend beyond the standard 10-year plan, and provided forgiveness of any unpaid loan principal at the end of the repayment period.11 Loan forgiveness ensured that borrowers were not making payments indefinitely due to the accrued interest.12

Congress did not accept the Reagan Administration’s proposal and instead established a pilot program called the Income-Contingent Direct Loan Demonstration Project, separate from the existing NDSL Program, as part of the 1986 Reauthorization. The demonstration project provided loans with unsubsidized interest rates and a repayment plan based on income for low-income students at 10 institutions.13 In 1987, the Reagan Administration proposed expanding the pilot in order to reduce the cost of the GSL program to the government, which was largely driven by interest subsidies for borrowers and defaulted loans.14 However, Congress did not agree to the expansion and later terminated the Income-Contingent Direct Loan Demonstration Project through the 1992 HEA Reauthorization.15

At the same time, the 1992 HEA Reauthorization legislation created a new pilot program: the Federal Direct Loan Demonstration Project. This pilot provided loans financed by the government directly to students through their institutions, and included a requirement that 35 percent of institutions in the program have an income-driven repayment plan.16 This demonstration project resulted in the underpinning of what we now know as the Federal Direct Loan Program, which gave the federal government direct control over loans distributed through the program and facilitated the government’s ability to create income-driven repayment plans.

1990s: Creation of Extended, Graduated, Income-Contingent, and Income-Sensitive Repayment Plans

Scene: 4:34-8:14 minutes

In 1993, the Omnibus Budget Reconciliation Act legislated that the Federal Direct Loan Demonstration Project expand from constituting five to 60 percent of all new federal loans by 1999.17 To provide Direct Loan borrowers with various options, the legislation introduced three repayment plans: Extended, Graduated, and Income-Contingent Repayment

FIGURE 1:
Federal Costs of Student Loan Defaults in the 1980s (1990 Dollars)

(ICR) Plans.\(^\text{18}\) The Extended Repayment Plan allowed students to repay their loans with either fixed or graduated payments over 25 years.\(^\text{19}\) The Graduated Repayment Plan enabled borrowers to make small monthly payments, which increased by a fixed amount every two years for up to 10 years.\(^\text{20}\) The ICR Plan offered reduced monthly payments based on adjusted gross income with the option of debt forgiveness after 25 years of payments.\(^\text{21}\) These flexible repayment plans were not made available to Federal Family Education Loan (FFEL) Program borrowers, an overarching program comprised of bank-based loans, including the GSL Program, because it would be politically and logistically complicated.\(^\text{22}\) Additional details about currently available income-driven repayment plans are included in the Loan Repayment Key Facts chart (see pages 12-15).

Wanting to ensure that FFEL borrowers also had access to flexible options, Congress created the Income-Sensitive Repayment (ISR) Plan for FFEL borrowers in 1998 through the HEA Reauthorization. This legislation also made FFEL borrowers eligible for the Extended and Graduated Repayment Plans.\(^\text{23}\) The terms of the Extended, Graduated, and ISR repayment plans were left to the discretion of participating lenders.

2007–Present: Income-Based Repayment, Pay As You Earn, and Revised Pay As You Earn Plans

Scene: 8:14-13:21 minutes

With continued growth in college costs and student loan debt, Congress passed the College Cost Reduction and Access Act (CCRAA) of 2007 to help more students and families manage these expenses. CCRAA created the Income-Based Repayment (IBR) Program to enable most federal loan borrowers experiencing financial hardship to reduce their monthly loan payments.\(^\text{24}\) The only loan programs ineligible for IBR are Parent PLUS Loans and Consolidated Loans that include a Parent PLUS Loan. Payments under IBR are capped at 15 percent of discretionary income, but not greater than the monthly payment that would have been required under standard 10-year repayment, and any loan balance remaining after 25 years of qualifying payments is forgiven. Borrowers were eligible for IBR beginning July 1, 2009.

On March 30, 2010, Obama signed into law the Health Care and Education Reconciliation Act, which eliminated the ability to issue new loans under the FFEL Program.\(^\text{25}\) The projected $67 billion in cost savings were used to increase Pell Grant aid and support other college access and career readiness programs. Savings were also used to enhance the IBR Program.\(^\text{26}\) Under the

Well, we really emphasized that borrowers would have a choice about how to repay, and they could change that choice over time.

Maureen McLaughlin
revised IBR Program, payments for new borrowers were capped at 10 percent of discretionary income, compared with 15 percent previously, and loans were forgiven after 20 years, instead of 25 years. However, to limit costs, only borrowers taking out their first loans after July 1, 2014 were eligible.

Since 2011, the Obama Administration has taken administrative action to allow more student loan borrowers the opportunity to qualify for the more generous forms of income-driven repayment. In October 2011, the Obama Administration announced an income-driven plan, Pay As You Earn (PAYE), with the same terms as the IBR Program authorized in 2010 but would allow borrowers to be eligible earlier than the original 2014 start date. However, this new plan was still not universal. To be eligible for PAYE, borrowers must have taken out their first loan on October 2007 or later and must still have been borrowing after September 30, 2011.

In June 2014, President Obama proposed another income-driven repayment plan to make the remaining Federal Direct Loan borrowers eligible for repayment terms akin to the IBR program authorized in the 2010 law. However, by this time, criticism had begun to mount that the 2010 repayment terms were too generous and program costs would be too high if extended to more students. Thus, the U.S. Department of Education established Revised Pay As You Earn (REPAYE), which set the same monthly payment cap as the IBR program (i.e., 10 percent of discretionary income) but extended the repayment period for graduate students from 20 to 25 years. Undergraduate students would still have their debt forgiven after 20 years of payments. The final REPAYE regulations were released October 2015 and the program went into effect on July 1, 2016.

With the introduction of PAYE and REPAYE, concerns have been raised that there are too many options for loan repayment, making it confusing for borrowers. Per an estimate generated by the U.S. Department of Treasury, more than half (51 percent) of Direct Loan borrowers were eligible for IBR, only 13 percent participated in IBR and two percent repaid through PAYE in 2014. The U.S. Government Accountability Office has encouraged the U.S. Department of Education to better inform borrowers about their repayment and loan forgiveness options. By the first quarter of 2016, the number of borrowers participating in an income-driven repayment plan had increased to 20 percent of all federal loan borrowers. In 2016, the Obama Administration also announced more efforts to further increase awareness of repayment options and help borrowers enroll in income-driven repayment plans.

Additionally, in order to simplify repayment options, the Obama Administration’s 2016 budget proposed that REPAYE would become the only income-driven repayment plan for new borrowers; however, this can only occur with support from Congress. Although the terms of repayment plans are often debated, higher education stakeholders agree income-driven repayment is important because it provides flexibility to help borrowers manage their debt.
# Loan Repayment

## Key Facts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Standard Repayment Plan</th>
<th>Extended Repayment Plan</th>
<th>Graduated Repayment Plan</th>
<th>Income-Contingent Repayment Plan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Common Name</strong></td>
<td>Standard</td>
<td>Extended</td>
<td>Graduated</td>
<td>ICR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Created</strong></td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>1993</td>
<td>1993</td>
<td>1993</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Payment**         | Monthly payments are fixed | Monthly payments are fixed or graduated. | Starts with low monthly payments then gradually increases, typically every two years. | Based on adjusted gross income, family size, and the total loan balance. Monthly payment is the lesser of:  
  - 20 percent of discretionary income, or  
  - what a borrower would pay on a repayment plan with a fixed payment over the course of 12 years, adjusted according to income |
| **Term**            | Up to 10 years or up to 30 years for Consolidation Loans | Up to 25 years | Up to 10 years or up to 30 years for Consolidation Loans | Up to 25 years |
| **Loan Forgiveness** | None                    | None                    | None                     | Any remaining balance is forgiven after 25 years. |
# KEY FACTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Common Name</th>
<th>Income-Sensitive Repayment Plan</th>
<th>Income-Based Repayment Program</th>
<th>Pay As You Earn Plan</th>
<th>Revised Pay As You Earn Plan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Payment⁵⁹</td>
<td>ISR</td>
<td>IBR</td>
<td>PAYE</td>
<td>REPAYE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Payment</td>
<td>Payments are based on yearly income and can vary depending on lender’s repayment calculation.</td>
<td>For borrowers taking out loans prior to July 1, 2014: Monthly payments are capped at 15 percent of discretionary income. For borrowers after July 1, 2014: Monthly payments are capped at 10 percent of discretionary income.</td>
<td>Monthly payments are generally 10 percent of discretionary income.</td>
<td>Monthly payments are generally 10 percent of discretionary income.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Term</td>
<td>Up to 15 years</td>
<td>Up to 25 years</td>
<td>Up to 20 years</td>
<td>Up to 20 years for undergraduate loans and 25 years for graduate loans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loan Forgiveness</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>For borrowers taking out loans prior to July 1, 2014: Any remaining balance is forgiven after 25 years. For borrowers after July 1, 2014: Any remaining balance is forgiven after 20 years.</td>
<td>Any remaining balance is forgiven after 20 years.</td>
<td>Any remaining balance is forgiven after 20 years for undergraduate loans and 25 for graduate loans.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**NOTE:** Students are eligible for different repayment plans based on the type of loan they borrowed and the origination date. Refer to the source for more details.

TIMELINE

1958
National Defense Education Act
» Created the nation’s first federal student loan program, the National Defense Student Loan, later known as the Perkins Loan. Under its repayment term, students had up to 11 years to pay off their loan through equal or graduated payments.

1965
Higher Education Act (HEA)
» Created the Guaranteed Student Loan (GSL) Program to make subsidized loans to low- and middle-income students and its accompanying 10-year repayment term, later known as the Standard Repayment Plan.

1986
HEA Reauthorization
» Created the Income-Contingent Direct Loan Demonstration Project and an income-contingent repayment plan for participating institutions.

1992
HEA Reauthorization
» Combined Subsidized Stafford Loans (formerly known as the GSL Program), Unsubsidized Stafford Loans, Federal Consolidated Loans, and Federal PLUS Loans into one overarching program called the Federal Family Education Loan (FFEL) Program.
» Terminated the Income-Contingent Direct Loan Demonstration Project.
» Created the Federal Direct Loan Demonstration Project to provide government-financed loans to students through their institutions.

1993
Omnibus Budget Reconciliation Act
» Expanded the Federal Direct Loan Demonstration Project and established that it account for 60 percent of all new loans by 1999. Qualified Federal Direct Loan borrowers would be able to repay using three new repayment options: Extended, Graduated, and Income-Contingent Repayment.

1998
HEA Reauthorization
» Created the Income-Sensitive Repayment Plan for FFEL borrowers.
» Authorized Extended and Graduated Plans to be available for FFEL borrowers.

2007
College Cost Reduction and Access Act
» Created the Income-Based Repayment (IBR) Program for FFEL and Direct Loan borrowers with economic hardship starting July 1, 2008.

2010
Health Care and Education Reconciliation Act (HCERA)
» Eliminated the FFEL Program.
» Revised the IBR Program to lower new borrowers’ loan payments to 10 percent (from 15 percent) of their discretionary income and forgave borrowers’ debt after 20 years of payments (instead of 25 years). New borrowers would be those who took out their first loan after July 1, 2014.

2011
Presidential Memorandum from President Obama
» Launched the Pay As You Earn (PAYE) Plan, starting December 21, 2012. The PAYE Plan has the same terms as the modified IBR Program under HCERA of 2010, but is available to additional borrowers. PAYE extends IBR to borrowers who received loans after September 30, 2007, and continued to borrow beyond September 30, 2011.

2015
Presidential Memorandum from President Obama
» Announced the Revised PAYE Plan for borrowers who received federal loans before October 2007 but who had not received loans since October 2011. Monthly payments remained as 10 percent of discretionary income. Borrowers’ debt would be forgiven after 20 years of repayment for students with loans for undergraduate education and 25 years for graduate education.
FEATURED EXPERTS

Pauline Abernathy

Melody Barnes

Tom Butts

Jason Delisle
Legislative Assistant, Office of Congressman Thomas E. Petri (R-WI), 2000–2006; Professional Staff, U.S. Senate Budget Committee, 2006–2007

Joyce DeMoss

Joe Flader
Legislative Director and Chief of Staff, Office of Congressman Tom Petri (R-WI), 1979–2001

Gaby Gomez

Frank Holleman

Kevin James
Legislative Assistant, Office of Congressman Tom Petri (R-WI), 2009–2014

Richard Jerue

Maureen McLaughlin
Acting Assistant Secretary and Deputy Assistant Secretary, Office of Postsecondary Education, U.S. Department of Education, 1993–2002

Kenneth Redd

Robert Shireman

Mark Zuckerman
FOOTNOTES


5 Ibid.

6 Ibid.


8 The Omnibus Reconciliation Act of 1990 (107 Stat. 1436. Sec. 4558(b)) is the first public law to use the phrase “standard repayment plan” to describe a fixed payment schedule over 10 years. Subsequent changes to standard repayment include periodic changes to the grace period, interest rate, loan limits, and enrollment status of applicants.


11 Ibid.


16 Ibid.


19 Ibid.

20 Ibid.

21 Ibid.


37 Ibid.


39 Discretionary income is calculated as the difference between adjusted gross income and 150% of the poverty guideline for family size and state of residence.


The Institute for Higher Education Policy (IHEP) is a nonpartisan, nonprofit organization committed to promoting access to and success in higher education for all students. Based in Washington, D.C., IHEP develops innovative policy- and practice-oriented research to guide policymakers and education leaders, who develop high-impact policies that will address our nation’s most pressing education challenges.

Lumina Foundation is an independent, private foundation committed to increasing the proportion of Americans with high-quality degrees, certificates and other credentials to 60 percent by 2025. Lumina’s outcomes-based approach focuses on helping to design and build an accessible, responsive and accountable higher education system while fostering a national sense of urgency for action to achieve Goal 2025.